

# EXHIBIT F

**Scholarly, Media Analysis, & Commentary by Electeds  
on New Jersey County Line Ballot Design**

**I. Scholarships and Academic Analysis (Chronological Order)**

William E. Schluter, *SOFT CORRUPTION: HOW UNETHICAL CONDUCT UNDERMINES GOOD GOVERNMENT AND WHAT TO DO ABOUT IT* (Rutgers University Press 2017) (describing impact of party line on soft corruption and nepotism).

Brett M. Pugach, Esq., *The County Line: The Law and Politics of Ballot Positioning in New Jersey*, 72 RUTGERS U.L. REV. 629 (Spring 2020).

Julia Sass Rubin, *New Jersey's Primary Ballot Design Enables Party Insiders to Pick Winners*. Rutgers University (June 2020), retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/doi:10.7282/t3-31dy-0j57> (last accessed Feb. 24, 2024).

Julia Sass Rubin, *Does the County Line Matter? An Analysis of New Jersey's 2020 Primary Election Results*, N.J. POLICY PERSPECTIVE (August 2020), available at: <https://www.njpp.org/publications/report/does-the-county-line-matter-an-analysis-of-new-jerseys-2020-primary-election-results/> (last accessed Feb. 24, 2024).

Press Release, *FDU Poll: NJ Residents Want Smaller Role for County Parties*, INSIDER NJ (Nov. 16, 2022), available at: <https://www.insidernj.com/press-release/fdu-poll-nj-residents-want-smaller-role-for-county-parties/> (“Only 19 percent of New Jersey say that county parties should have a role in officially endorsing candidates and giving them preferential placement on the ballot, while 2/3rds oppose such a role.”) (last accessed Feb. 24, 2024).

Ryan P. Haygood, Henal Patel, Nuzhat Chowdhury, *The End of the Line: Abolishing New Jersey's Antidemocratic Primary Ballot Design*, 48 SETON HALL J. OF LEGIS. AND PUB. POL'Y 1 (2023).

Samuel S. H. Wang, Hayden Goldberg, Julia Sass Rubin, *Three Tests for Bias Arising From the Design of Primary Election Ballots in New Jersey*, 48 SETON HALL J. OF LEGIS. AND PUB. POL'Y 24 (2023).

Julia Sass Rubin, *The Impact of New Jersey's County Line Primary Ballots on Election Outcomes, Politics, and Policy*, 48 SETON HALL J. OF LEGIS. AND PUB. POL'Y 48 (2023).

## II. Media

### A. Opinion Editorials (Chronological Order)

Star-Ledger Editorial Board Opinion, Tom Moran, *Tuesday's Primary Election is Rigged for The Old Guard*, NEW JERSEY STAR LEDGER (June 6, 2021), available at:

<https://www.nj.com/opinion/2021/06/tuesdays-primary-election-is-rigged-for-the-old-guard-moran.html> (last accessed Feb. 24, 2024).

Clifford Kulwin and Ahmed Shedeed, Opinion Editorial, *Voter Suppression by Another Name*, NEW JERSEY STAR LEDGER (May 2, 2021), available at:

<https://www.nj.com/opinion/2021/05/voter-suppression-by-another-name-opinion.html> (by Rabbi emeritus of Temple B'nai Abraham and President of Islamic Center of Jersey City) (“New Jersey parties endow their anointed with a tremendous advantage, which means not only are voters denied the opportunity for a truly fair election, but once in office, those officials have ae loyalty to the party insiders who could supersede the obligation to their constituents... [W]e hope the lawsuit challenging [the primary ballot design] succeeds, for it is surely immoral.”)

Ronald Chen and John Farmer, Jr., Guest Opinion Editorial, *New Jersey's Primary Election Ballots are Rigged*, NEW JERSEY STAR LEDGER (June 27, 2021), available at:

<https://www.nj.com/opinion/2021/06/new-jerseys-primary-election-ballots-are-rigged-opinion.html> (by NJ's Attorney General 1999-2006 and then-director of Eagleton Institute of Politics at Rutgers University, and Distinguished Professor of Law, Former Public Advocate for New Jersey and Dean of Rutgers School of Law-Newark) (“[The county line] enables entrenched political machines to remain in power and frustrate the ambitions of emerging and historically marginalized groups. A candidate, even an incumbent, must tailor his or her positions to satisfy the party establishment rather than the voters whose wishes a primary election is ostensibly designed to measure. The county line discourages candidates from deviating from the dictates of party insiders, and thus encourages them to see themselves as representing the interests of party insiders more than the public welfare. It commits important decisions of public policy to the deliberations of private, unelected bosses, who serve as puppet-masters on issues involving their interests, and frustrates any effort to hold those private interests accountable.”).

Susan Druckenbrod and Rena Margulis, Guest Opinion Editorial, *Ballot Line Makes Independent Candidates Into Invisible Ones*, NJ SPOTLIGHT NEWS (Dec. 16, 2021), available at:

<https://www.njspotlightnews.org/2021/12/ballot-line-ballot-siberia-party-insiders-independent-candidates-ballot-position-placement/> (last accessed Feb. 24, 2024).

Anoinette Miles, Guest Opinion Editorial, *New Jerseyans Overwhelmingly Want to Ditch Ballots That Favor Party Candidates*, NEW JERSEY STAR LEDGER (Dec. 5, 2022), available at:

<https://www.nj.com/opinion/2022/12/new-jerseyans-overwhelmingly-want-to-ditch-ballots-that-favor-party-candidates-opinion.html> (by then-Political Director, now-Interim State Director of New Jersey Working Families Party) (“By using ballot design tricks to take power away from the voters to pick their elected representatives, county parties can solidify their own power at the expense of a healthy democracy. . . It’s time to discard a tradition based on outdated party bossism and backroom deals and join the rest of the nation in implementing a ballot system that establishes a level playing field for all candidates.”)

Debbie Walsh, Opinion Editorial, *Women’s Legislative Progress in Peril*, N.J. GLOBE (Apr. 3, 2023), available at: <https://newjerseyglobe.com/legislature/opinion-womens-legislative-progress-in-peril/> (last accessed Feb. 24, 2024) (By Director of the Center for American Women and Politics of Eagleton Institute of Politics at Rutgers University) (“The party line in New Jersey politics, which bestows beneficial placement on voters’ ballots as well as electoral resources, has become an almost unassailable fortress, controlled by political elites that bestow their favor on preferred candidates. Of the candidates expected to have the party line this year, only about 38% are women. And of those women who have the party line, only 44% are running in a district that is currently represented by someone in their party. What we can’t know is how many women chose not to run at all because they couldn’t secure the party line. . . If this is the sort of abusive potential inherent to our party line system, then that system must end. Granting party insiders the power to give their preferred slates of candidates an unfair advantage by way of boosted ballot placement undermines the agency of New Jersey voters and stifles the political conversation that allows the best ideas and candidates to capture the attention of voters. It crushes the potential for new candidates to emerge in Garden State politics.”)

Star-Ledger Editorial Board Opinion, Tom Moran, *In Senate Race, A Brewing Revolt Against the Machine*, NEW JERSEY STAR LEDGER (Feb. 4, 2024), available at: <https://www.nj.com/opinion/2024/02/in-senate-race-a-brewing-revolt-against-the-machine-moran.html> (last accessed Feb. 24, 2024).

Amber Reed, Jeffrey Chang, Patrick Stegemoeller, Ronak Patel, Bob Sakaniwa, Commentary, *How New Jersey’s Line Disempowers Asian Americans*, N.J. MONITOR (Feb. 13, 2024), available at: <https://newjerseymonitor.com/2024/02/13/how-new-jerseys-line-disempowers-asian-americans/> (by New Jersey Asian American leaders affiliated with Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders of New Jersey, Asian American Legal Defense and Education Fund, and APIA Vote) (describing racial underrepresentation in New Jersey, and explaining “[a] healthy democracy is transparent, competitive, and leaves the most serious decision-making to those our Constitution entrusts: the voters. New Jersey must join the rest of the nation in having fair ballots and give AAPIs, and all of our communities of color, a fighting chance.”).

## B. Media Analysis (Chronological Order)

Matt Friedman, *Anti-machine Democrats in Camden County complain of 'Phantom Candidates'*, POLITICO (Apr. 10, 2019), available at: <https://www.politico.com/states/new-jersey/story/2019/04/09/anti-machine-democrats-in-camden-county-complain-of-phantom-candidates-960442> (last accessed Feb. 20, 2024).

Fred Snowflake, *On Principle, DiMaso Breaches the Golden Rule*, INSIDER NJ (March 17, 2021), available at: <https://www.insidernj.com/principle-dimaso-breaches-golden-rule/> (last accessed Feb. 25, 2024) (“Sometimes the best, if not the only, way to get rid of incumbents in New Jersey is for the party boss to ‘disown’ them.”).

Max Pizarro, *The 2021 Reemergence of the County Party Chairs*, INSIDER NJ (Apr. 11, 2021), available at: <https://www.insidernj.com/2021-reemergence-county-party-county-chairs/> (last accessed Feb. 25, 2024).

Colleen O’Dea, *Biggest Winner in NJ Primary? The Power of the Party Bosses*, NJ SPOTLIGHT NEWS (June 10, 2021), available at: <https://www.njspotlightnews.org/2021/06/nj-primary-election-main-takeaways-gops-pro-trump-movement-is-strong-party-bosses-remain-powerful/> (last accessed Feb. 24, 2024).

Dustin Racioppi, *Andy Kim is Tired of New Jersey being a ‘laughingstock’*, POLITICO (Dec. 10, 2023), <https://www.politico.com/news/2023/12/10/andy-kim-nj-senate-race-00130460> (last accessed Feb. 20, 2024).

Nick Corasaniti and Tracey Tully, *A Senate Candidate Accused of Nepotism Has Another Edge: The Ballot*, THE NEW YORK TIMES (Dec. 22, 2023), available at: <https://www.nytimes.com/2023/12/22/nyregion/menendez-tammy-murphy-senate-new-jersey.html> (last accessed Feb. 23, 2024).

Matt Friedman, *Have you heard of this thing called ‘the line’?* POLITICO (Feb. 9, 2024), available at: <https://www.politico.com/newsletters/new-jersey-playbook/2024/02/09/have-you-heard-of-this-thing-called-the-line-00140622> (last accessed Feb. 23, 2024).

Nancy Solomon, *Tammy Murphy Gets Key Placement on Many NJ Primary Ballots, Since Democratic Bosses Say So*, GOTHAMIST (Feb. 12, 2024), available at: <https://gothamist.com/news/tammy-murphy-gets-key-placement-on-many-nj-primary-ballots-since-democratic-bosses-say-so> (last accessed Feb. 24, 2024).

Joey Fox, *It's Another Big Weekend in N.J.'s Democratic Senate Primary*, N.J. GLOBE (Feb. 23, 2024), available at: <https://newjerseyglobe.com/congress/its-another-big-weekend-in-n-j-s-democratic-senate-primary/> (last accessed Feb. 24, 2024).

### III. Commentary by Elected Officials (Chronological Order)

David Wildstein, *Vainieri Huttie will skip Bergen Dem convention, will run off the line in Senate Primary*, N.J. GLOBE (Feb. 23, 2021), available at: <https://newjerseyglobe.com/legislature/vainieri-huttie-will-skip-bergen-dem-convention-will-run-off-the-line-in-senate-primary/> (last accessed Feb. 23, 2024) (eight-term assemblywoman objects to process that did not give her a chance to compete for the county line).

Announcement by Nicholas A. Chiaravalloti (April 19, 2021), available at: <https://www.tapinto.net/towns/bayonne/sections/elections/articles/nicholas-a-chiaravalloti-announcement> (last accessed Feb. 23, 2024) (three-term Assembly Majority Whip Nicholas Chiaravalloti withdraws nomination for fourth bid, announcing: “In reviewing my options, I considered running off the line. The task of winning off the line is daunting in a normal year; however, running against the HCDO [Hudson County Democratic Organization] this year would mean running against Governor Phil Murphy. I believe the power of the line and the popularity of Governor Murphy would make it impossible to compete successfully.”).

Joey Fox, *Turner comes out in Support of Abolishing County Lines*, N.J. GLOBE (Jan. 12, 2023), available at: <https://newjerseyglobe.com/legislature/turner-comes-out-in-support-of-abolishing-county-lines/> (last accessed Feb. 24, 2024) (Legislator with a career in state and county politics that spans more than 40 years explains her support to abolish the line: “Then it’s a level playing field. Everybody starts at the same place – let the voters determine who the winner’s going to be. That’s the American way.”)

Ronald C. Rice, Tweet, X formerly known as Twitter (Nov. 30, 2023), available at: <https://x.com/RonaldCRice/status/1730236531804098890?s=20> (last accessed Feb. 25, 2024) (NJ politician tweeting, “Saying what we fmr & current NJ politicos have known 4 years. AND still nothing will change because of how many are vested in system & lack of political courage. #ISaidIt” ‘Party lines’ an unfair advantage on ballots, new report says <https://njspotlightnews.org/video/party-lines-an-unfair-advantage-on-ballots-new-report-says/>... via @NJSpotlightNews.”)

Riley Rogerson, *The Weird Gimmick That May Decide New Jersey’s Next Senator*, THE DAILY BEAST (Dec. 6, 2023), available at: <https://www.thedailybeast.com/the-weird-gimmick-that-may-decide-new-jerseys-next-senator> (last accessed Feb. 24, 2024) (Congressman Bill Pascrell

acknowledges that county line endorsements were ‘part of the equation’ to support First Lady Tammy Murphy’s bid for the senatorial seat, explaining: “‘It was difficult for me to tell him,’ Pascrell said of his friend Kim. ‘But don’t forget. That’s the line in every county and eight counties have already jumped in the pool. Do I fight my county chairman?’”).

Joey Fox, *An Interview with Bonnie Watson-Coleman*, (Feb. 15, 2024) available at <https://newjerseyglobe.com/congress/an-interview-with-bonnie-watson-coleman/> (NJ Congresswoman explains, “the political mechanisms that order who gets to be the candidate, who gets the valued position on the ballot, who gets to be supported – that had generally been controlled by white men who were most comfortable with advancing people that they knew best, which were white men.”)

State Senator Troy Singleton, Public Comment, Burlington County Convention (Feb. 24, 2024) (declaring support to abolish the county line, explaining “If we’re not continuously learning, we’re not doing the job we’re meant to do. When I continue to talk to so many different people about this process, for me, it’s been an evolution... I think all counties should move in that direction.”). See Joey Fox, *Troy Singleton Calls for Abolishing County Lines*, N.J. GLOBE (Feb. 24, 2024), available at: <https://newjerseyglobe.com/campaigns/troy-singleton-calls-for-abolishing-county-lines/> (last accessed Feb. 24, 2024).

Steven Fulop, Tweet, X formerly known as Twitter (Feb. 24, 2024) available at: <https://x.com/StevenFulop/status/1761437859288875234?s=20> (last accessed Feb. 25, 2024) (Jersey City Mayor and NJ Gubernatorial candidate first came out against the party line in October 2023, then calling it “undemocratic” and that the system “disenfranchise[s] a lot of people.” Responding to Troy Singleton’s Feb. 24, 2024 declaration to abolish the line, Fulop tweets: “Welcome to the club! I wonder if he will get the pushback that I did. Regardless, I know people that rely on the structure may not like hearing it but democracy in #NJ would be better with bloc voting. It would encourage more diversity in candidates, make county/local/state campaigns more competitive + would encourage more democratic volunteers on campaigns bc they would believe their voice/work matter.”) See also Daniel Han, ‘Undemocratic’: Fulop supports Ending the ‘Line,’ POLITICO PRO ‘Line’ (Oct. 9, 2023), available at: <https://subscriber.politicopro.com/article/2023/10/undemocratic-fulop-wants-to-end-the-line-00120478> (last accessed Feb. 24, 2024).